

March 2021



Findings from the First 5 California Home Visiting Workforce Study

Appendix C. Results Highlighted in the Report

Sarah Shea Crowne, Danielle Hegseth, Yuko Yadatsu Ekyalongo, Rachel Chazan Cohen, Erin Bultinck, Maggie Haas, Sara Anderson, and Madeline Carter

The study is funded by First 5 California and was conducted by Child Trends with support from Harder+Company Community Research and Advent Consulting.



Appendix C. Results Highlighted in the Report

All data are presented as percentages unless otherwise noted. Blank cells indicate where data were suppressed due to fewer than five responses to any given question.

Home visiting workforce demographics

Table 1. Licenses and certifications held by the workforce (N = 906)

Licenses and certifications	Overall	Home Visitor	Supervisor
Certified Lactation Educator	18	17	25
California Child Development Permit	17	15	24
Registered Nurse (RN)	15	15	15
Certified Parenting Educator	12	12	10
Preschool Child Development Associate (CDA)	6	7	3
Infant/Toddler Child Development Associate (CDA)	5	6	1
Certified Nursing Assistant (CNA)	4	4	3
Other state teaching certification (e.g., early childhood, K-12)	3	3	5
Home Visitor Child Development Associate (CDA)	3	3	2
California State Teaching Credential	2	2	3
Certified Lactation Consultant (IBCLC)	2	2	3
California Licensed Clinical Social Worker (LCSW)	1	1	1
California Associate Clinical Social Worker (ASW)	1	1	2
Nurse Practitioner (NP)	1	1	1
Licensed Clinical Social Worker (LCSW)	1	<1	3
Infant Mental Health Endorsement	1	<1	3
Licensed Vocational Nurse (LVN)	<1	<1	1
Certified Nurse Midwife (CNM)	<1	<1	0
Certified Family Life Educator (CFLE)	<1	1	0
Licensed Marriage and Family Therapist	<1	0	2
Licensed Social Worker Associate (LSWA)	0	0	0
Licensed Practical Nurse (LPN)	0	0	0
Licensed Graduate Social Worker (LGSW)	0	0	0
Licensed Independent Clinical Social Worker (LICSW)	0	0	0
Other	20	19	24

Table 2. Staff receipt of public assistance benefits (N = 851)

Public assistance benefit	Overall	Home Visitor	Supervisor
Medi-Cal	13	15	5
WIC	8	10	2
CalFresh	4	5	1
CalWORKs	2	2	1
Unemployment	2	2	1

Public assistance benefit	Overall	Home Visitor	Supervisor
Section 8 Housing	1	1	1
Supplemental Security Income (SSI)	1	1	2
Other	1	1	1
None	82	80	92

Note: Respondents were asked to select all that apply

Table 3. Ways workforce learned of home visiting (N = 906)

	Overall	Home Visitors	Supervisors
I already worked for the agency in a different capacity	31	29	42
I heard about the position through my professional network	25	25	25
I saw an advertisement for the position (e.g., online or in a local newspaper)	22	23	15
I was a home visiting client	8	8	4
I heard about the position through an instructor or program at my college	6	6	4
One of my family members or friends was a home visiting client in a home visiting program	4	5	1
I heard about the position through an apprenticeship with the program	2	2	2
I was once referred to a home visiting program but did not enroll	1	1	0
Other	14	13	14

Table 4. Average mindfulness score across staff* (N = 812)

Role	Mean	SD	Min	Max
Overall	25.88	5.41	7	36
Home Visitors	25.61	5.52	7	36
Supervisors	27.23	4.62	17	36

*As measured by the Cognitive and Affective Mindfulness Scale-Revised (CAM5-R)

Changes in home visiting services during the pandemic

Table 5. Average length of time for virtual home visiting communication methods (N = 637)

	Mean (SD)
In person visits (in minutes)[†]	
On average or typically	50 (30)
When it's a very long visit	71 (38)
When it's a short visit	30 (23)
Voice only visits on the phone or computer (in minutes)	
On average or typically	40 (20)
When it's a very long visit	62 (32)
When it's a short visit	25 (15)

	Mean (SD)
Video visits on the phone or computer (in minutes)	
On average or typically	43 (21)
When it's a very long visit	62 (34)
When it's a short visit	29 (16)
Number of texts sent per week^{††}	
On average or for a typical family	10 (26)
When it's a lot of texts (for a family who has a lot of needs)	16 (34)
When it's a few texts (for a family with few needs)	5 (12)

† The sample size for this variable was considerably lower than the sample size of the table, at large (n = 130)

†† The sample size for this variable was considerably lower than the sample size of the table, at large (n = 506)

Table 6. Changes in work schedules due to COVID-19 (N = 837)

Changes in work schedule	Number of hours or days worked pre COVID-19	Number of hours or days worked currently ⁱ
Overall		
Hours per day worked	7.97	7.94
Days of the week worked	4.88	4.91
Evenings per week worked	0.43	0.72
Early mornings per week worked	1.42	1.46
Weekends per month worked	0.25	0.46
Hours scheduled or paid to work per week	36.88	36.89
Actual hours per week worked	38.84	39.34
Home visitors (mean)		
Hours per day worked	7.97	7.90
Days of the week worked	4.87	4.89
Evenings per week worked	0.41	0.66
Early mornings per week worked	1.38	1.38
Weekends per month worked	0.27	0.45
Hours scheduled or paid to work per week	36.77	36.78
Actual hours per week worked	38.61	38.90
Supervisors (mean)		
Hours per day worked	7.96	8.24
Days of the week worked	4.94	5.01
Evenings per week worked	0.58	1.11
Early mornings per week worked	1.65	1.98
Weekends per month worked	0.15	0.47
Hours scheduled or paid to work per week	37.66	37.69
Actual hours per week worked	40.44	42.32

ⁱ "Currently" denotes the point in time when the home visiting staff completed this workforce survey.

Note: Supervisors with a caseload were classified as home visitors in these analyses

Table 7. Changes in home visitor job responsibilities due to COVID-19 (N = 705)

	Increase	Decrease	No change
Outreach and recruiting families	8	25	67
Initial assessments (intake, registration, etc.)	7	18	76
Preparing for home visits	9	16	75
Traveling to families	4	66	30
Conducting home visits	6	35	60
Making and following up on referrals (outside of the visit)	12	11	78
Receiving supervision	5	7	87
Training	16	13	71
Staff meetings	9	8	83
Paperwork or data entry into computer or tablet (outside of the visit)	14	7	79
Providing concrete supports (e.g., diapers, food)	16	14	70
Transporting clients	1	12	87

Training, supervision, and supports available to home visitors

Table 8. Source of staff training in various content areas (N = 824)

How staff received training	Home Visitor
Maternal health and well being	
Prenatal health	
Through formal college coursework	34
Embedded in pre-service training	32
During in-service training	47
Maternal physical health	
Through formal college coursework	35
Embedded in pre-service training	32
During in-service training	47
Family planning/reproductive health	
Through formal college coursework	37
Embedded in pre-service training	29
During in-service training	44
Tobacco/substance use	
Through formal college coursework	34
Embedded in pre-service training	32
During in-service training	49
Family stress and mental health	
Through formal college coursework	37
Embedded in pre-service training	41
During in-service training	63

How staff received training	Home Visitor
Intimate partner violence	
Through formal college coursework	30
Embedded in pre-service training	37
During in-service training	56
Parenting	
Breastfeeding, feeding and nutrition	
Through formal college coursework	30
Embedded in pre-service training	35
During in-service training	55
Positive parenting behavior	
Through formal college coursework	31
Embedded in pre-service training	42
During in-service training	65
Child maltreatment/mandated reporting	
Through formal college coursework	36
Embedded in pre-service training	52
During in-service training	64
Child health and development	
Child health and pediatric care	
Through formal college coursework	34
Embedded in pre-service training	33
During in-service training	50
Child development	
Through formal college coursework	57
Embedded in pre-service training	41
During in-service training	57
Early literacy	
Through formal college coursework	39
Embedded in pre-service training	34
During in-service training	52
Access to community resources	
Community services for families	
Through formal college coursework	27
Embedded in pre-service training	38
During in-service training	61
LGBTQI+ services	
Through formal college coursework	22
Embedded in pre-service training	17
During in-service training	36

How staff received training	Home Visitor
Laws and public policy (e.g., immigration or family law)	
Through formal college coursework	22
Embedded in pre-service training	19
During in-service training	36
Addressing trauma	
Trauma-informed care	
Through formal college coursework	25
Embedded in pre-service training	36
During in-service training	63
Recognizing and responding to ACEs	
Through formal college coursework	22
Embedded in pre-service training	35
During in-service training	65
Staff cultural competence and communication	
Racial justice/equity	
Through formal college coursework	31
Embedded in pre-service training	26
During in-service training	51
Implicit bias and internalized racism	
Through formal college coursework	30
Embedded in pre-service training	27
During in-service training	54
Cultural sensitivity/diversity	
Through formal college coursework	38
Embedded in pre-service training	37
During in-service training	64
General clinical and communication skills	
Through formal college coursework	44
Embedded in pre-service training	29
During in-service training	45
Staff well being	
Stress management and self-care	
Through formal college coursework	30
Embedded in pre-service training	38
During in-service training	67
Self-reflection and reflective supervision	
Through formal college coursework	20
Embedded in pre-service training	37
During in-service training	63

How staff received training	Home Visitor
General home visitor training	
Database or case management system	
Through formal college coursework	12
Embedded in pre-service training	35
During in-service training	58
Use of technology in the field	
Through formal college coursework	18
Embedded in pre-service training	27
During in-service training	50
Implementing virtual home visiting	
Through formal college coursework	8
Embedded in pre-service training	22
During in-service training	57
Other[†]	
Through formal college coursework	14
Embedded in pre-service training	16
During in-service training	25

[†] The sample size for this variable was considerably lower than the sample size of the table, at large (n = 182)

Table 9. Types and frequency of supervision received by home visitors (N = 741)

	Home Visitor
Meetings with supervisor	
Frequency of meetings	
Weekly or more frequently	49
One to two times per month	18
Monthly	21
No one-on-one supervision meetings	12
Length of meetings	
Less than 30 minutes	10
30 minutes	16
More than 30 minutes	74
Meeting includes use of reflective supervision techniques	
Yes	93
Frequency of review of video recorded visits	
Monthly	8
Every few months	4
One to two times per year	6
No review of video recordings	83
Helpfulness of supervisor's feedback	
Extremely helpful	44

	Home Visitor
Very helpful	31
Somewhat helpful	19
Not at all or not very helpful	6
Live observation of home visits	
Frequency of supervisor's attendance at home visits (pre-COVID-19)	
Monthly	7
Every few months	23
Twice per year	18
Once per year	18
Supervisor did not attend visits	34
Frequency of supervisor's attendance at virtual visits (since COVID-19)	
One time	17
2-3 times	14
Four or more times	3
Supervisor did not join any virtual visits	65
Other types of supervision	
Frequency of peer supervision meetings	
Weekly or more frequently	36
One to two times per month	16
Monthly	26
Program does not provide peer supervision meetings	22
Frequency of group supervision or team meetings	
Weekly or more frequently	36
One to two times per month	22
Monthly	34
Program does not provide group supervision meetings	8

Table 10. Types of technological resources provided for use during visits (N = 714)

	Home Visitor
Cellphone/work phone	73
Laptops	69
iPads or other tablets	37
Phone service	23
Printer	16
Program helps with home Internet access	26
<i>provides a hot spot</i>	66
<i>pays for all or a portion of Internet service</i>	33
Other	12

Note (1): Respondents were asked to select all that apply

Note (2): Supervisors with a caseload were classified as home visitors in these analyses

Table 11. Home visitors' reported job satisfaction (N = 683)

Home visitor job satisfaction	Currently completely or somewhat satisfied
Job security	93
The amount of vacation time received	86
The amount of on-the-job stress experienced	62
Chances for promotion	60
The amount of time required to complete daily responsibilities	78
The amount of on-the-job travel required	87
Schedule flexibility	91
The health insurance benefits offered by employer	81
The retirement plan offered by employer	80
The recognition received at work for accomplishments	79
The amount of money earned	60
Relationship with immediate supervisor	91
Relationships with coworkers	94
The training and professional development opportunities available	86
How rewarding the work with families is	96
Work-life balance	86
The mentoring and support received	83
Job overall	91

Table 12. Home visitors' change in satisfaction due to COVID-19 (N = 507 - 520)

Home visitor job satisfaction	More satisfied than before COVID-19	No change in level of satisfaction	Less satisfied than before COVID-19
Job security	15	66	19
The amount of vacation time received	10	81	9
The amount of on-the-job stress experienced	8	53	38
Chances for promotion	5	81	14
The amount of time required to complete daily responsibilities	13	64	22
The amount of on-the-job travel required	28	64	8
Schedule flexibility	24	66	11
The health insurance benefits offered by employer	8	87	5
The retirement plan offered by employer	8	89	3
The recognition received at work for accomplishments	10	75	15
The amount of money earned	7	78	16
Relationship with immediate supervisor	12	79	9
Relationships with coworkers	10	76	14

Home visitor job satisfaction	More satisfied than before COVID-19	No change in level of satisfaction	Less satisfied than before COVID-19
The training and professional development opportunities available	9	76	15
How rewarding the work with families is	15	71	15
Work-life balance	12	63	25
The mentoring and support received	10	78	12
Job overall	11	73	16

Table 13. Supervisors' reported job satisfaction (N = 683)

Supervisor job satisfaction	Currently completely or somewhat satisfied
Job security	94
The amount of vacation time received	92
The amount of on-the-job stress experienced	63
Chances for promotion	74
The amount of time required to complete daily responsibilities	74
The amount of on-the-job travel required	96
Schedule flexibility	92
The health insurance benefits offered by employer	84
The retirement plan offered by employer	77
The recognition received at work for accomplishments	83
The amount of money earned	63
Relationship with immediate supervisor	91
Relationships with coworkers	97
The training and professional development opportunities available	89
How rewarding the work with families is	99
Work-life balance	83
The mentoring and support received	82
Job overall	96

Table 14. Supervisors' change in satisfaction due to COVID-19 (N = 683)

Supervisor job satisfaction	More satisfied than before COVID-19	No change in level of satisfaction	Less satisfied than before COVID-19
Job security	8	70	22
The amount of vacation time received	6	86	8
The amount of on-the-job stress experienced	6	57	38
Chances for promotion	3	90	8
The amount of time required to complete daily responsibilities	8	64	28

Supervisor job satisfaction	More satisfied than before COVID-19	No change in level of satisfaction	Less satisfied than before COVID-19
The amount of on-the-job travel required	18	76	6
Schedule flexibility	16	75	9
The health insurance benefits offered by employer	7	89	4
The retirement plan offered by employer	5	93	2
The recognition received at work for accomplishments	6	88	6
The amount of money earned	9	80	11
Relationship with immediate supervisor	8	85	7
Relationships with coworkers	9	80	11
The training and professional development opportunities available	7	77	15
How rewarding the work with families is	11	81	8
Work-life balance	8	66	26
The mentoring and support received	7	80	13
Job overall	9	75	16

Table 15. Work environment and pay (N = 825)

Environment	Overall	Home visitor	Supervisor
Ease of taking off during work day to take care of personal or family matters			
Very easy	47	46	50
Somewhat easy	40	41	38
Somewhat hard	10	10	10
Very hard	3	3	1

Table 16. Staff reported benefits provided by their employer (N = 819)

Benefit provided	
Travel reimbursement policy[†]	
Reimbursement for mileage only	64
Full reimbursement for all work travel costs including gas, mileage, and parking costs	21
Some reimbursement but it does not cover all mileage, gas, and parking costs	12
No reimbursement	3
Cost-of-Living Adjustment (COLA)	
Provided by employer	36
Availability of benefits	
Vacation or personal days	97
Sick leave (for own illness or to care for an ill relative)	95
Health insurance plan	95

Benefit provided	
Paid holidays	94
Dental benefits	92
Vision benefits	91
Life insurance	84
A pension or 401K plan (other than Social Security)	79
Paid short-term disability (e.g., paid maternity leave)	74
Flexible spending account for medical care	61
An employee assistance plan (e.g. legal or other types of counseling)	47
Flexible spending account for dependent care	44
Commuter benefits (e.g., subsidized parking)	40
Help paying for or reimbursement for education	36
Help paying for child care or child care on site	11

† The sample size for this variable was considerably lower than the sample size of the table, at large (n = 799)

Table 17. Main reasons for turnover among staff as reported by supervisors (N = 133)

Main reasons for turnover among staff	Major reason	Minor reason	Not a reason
Low salary	41	24	35
Pursuit of educational opportunities	38	21	41
Desire for a different kind of work	24	37	39
Moves to a position at another site or another home visiting program within your agency	20	16	65
Staff burnout due to data burden	18	27	54
Staff burnout due to heavy caseload	17	29	55
Desire for more job stability	17	22	61
Caregiving responsibilities (e.g., to care for one's children or parent)	16	29	55
Retirement	14	11	76
Moving out of the area	14	26	60
Limited benefits	13	25	62
Personal health reasons	13	30	57
Schedule challenges	11	22	68
Dislike travel required of job	10	20	70
Dismissal from employment due to performance	9	21	70
Concerns about safety in the field	7	26	68
Layoffs due to funding or other programmatic changes	5	11	83

Table 18. Home visitor caseload characteristics and related training received

Home visitor has been trained in...	Yes (N=416)	No (N=305)
Caseload has parents involved in child welfare system		
Prenatal health	78	70

Home visitor has been trained in...	Yes (N=416)	No (N=305)
Maternal physical health	79	70
Tobacco or substance use	79	71
Family stress and mental health	91	87
Intimate partner violence	84	73
Child maltreatment or mandated reporting	95	93
Child development	94	91
Community services for families	84	80
Trauma-informed care	86	82
Recognizing and responding to ACEs	88	82
LGBTQI+ services	59	42
Racial justice or equity	75	68
Implicit bias and internalized racism	77	70
Cultural sensitivity or diversity	90	84
General clinical and communication skills	77	67
Stress management and self-care	90	85
Laws and public policy	54	47
Implementing virtual home visiting	68	66
Training on how to conduct virtual home visits	59	59

Note: Supervisors with a caseload were classified as home visitors in these analyses

Table 19. Home visitor caseload characteristics and related training received

Home visitor has been trained in...	Yes (N=503)	No (N=217)
Caseload has parents with prenatal or postpartum depression or mental illness		
Prenatal health	79	63
Maternal physical health	80	65
Tobacco or substance use	81	64
Family stress and mental health	93	81
Intimate partner violence	85	67
Child maltreatment or mandated reporting	95	92
Child development	95	86
Community services for families	85	78
Trauma-informed care	89	72
Recognizing and responding to ACEs	89	75
LGBTQI+ services	58	37
Racial justice or equity	77	62
Implicit bias and internalized racism	79	63
Cultural sensitivity or diversity	90	80
General clinical and communication skills	76	66
Stress management and self-care	89	84
Laws and public policy	55	41

Home visitor has been trained in...	Yes (N=503)	No (N=217)
Implementing virtual home visiting	66	71
Training on how to conduct virtual home visits	57	65

Note: Supervisors with a caseload were classified as home visitors in these analyses

Table 20. Supports received by home visitors who have parents involved in the child welfare system on their caseload

	Yes (N=416)	No (N=305)
Home visitor receives...		
Weekly supervision	50	47
Very helpful or extremely helpful feedback from supervisor	74	74
Supervision that included attending a virtual visit since COVID-19	38	29
Program provides...		
Access to counseling	57	62
Access to mental health treatment	56	60
Opportunities for self-care, exercise, mindfulness	72	74

Note: Supervisors with a caseload were classified as home visitors in these analyses

Table 21. Supports received by home visitors who have parents with prenatal or postpartum depression on their caseload

	Yes (N=503)	No (N=217)
Home visitor receives...		
Weekly supervision	52	41
Very helpful or extremely helpful feedback from supervisor	74	74
Supervision that included attending a virtual visit since COVID-19	33	37
Program provides...		
Access to counseling	59	61
Access to mental health treatment	55	62
Opportunities for self-care, exercise, mindfulness	73	73

Note: Supervisors with a caseload were classified as home visitors in these analyses

Factors for retention

Table 22. Moderation analyses on the impact of COVID-19-related stress on depressive symptom, by mindfulness groups

Mindfulness Group	Correlation test (coefficient)	Linear model (coefficient)	Linear model with interaction (coefficient)
Overall	0.49***	0.30***	0.17***
Low mindfulness (score <= 22)	0.51***	0.35***	-0.64
Mid mindfulness (22 < score < 30)	0.40***	0.24***	-0.09
High mindfulness (score >= 30)	0.40***	0.17***	Reference
Interaction between COVID stress and low mindfulness			0.19***
Interaction between COVID stress and mid mindfulness			0.07

Note (1): Blank cells indicate that interaction analyses were not conducted

Note (2): * = $p \leq 0.05$ ** = $p \leq 0.01$ *** = $p \leq 0.001$

Table 23. Summary of factors that predicted likelihood of remaining in current position

Factors thought to influence likelihood of remaining in position	Factors that predicted likelihood of remaining in position (Bivariate)	Factors that predicted likelihood of remaining in position (Multivariate, without salary)	Factors that predicted likelihood of remaining in position (Multivariate, with salary)
Community level			
County-level rate of population living in rural area	1.01	1.00	1.00
Programmatic supports			
Supervision frequency	1.22	0.98	0.93
Supervisor joins virtual visits	0.91	0.76	0.96
Helpfulness of supervisor feedback	1.59*	1.12	0.97
Has a say in program decisions	2.28***	1.87*	2.19*
Received training on implementing virtual home visiting	2.11***	1.70*	1.84*
Received training on family stress and mental health	1.95^		

Factors thought to influence likelihood of remaining in position	Factors that predicted likelihood of remaining in position (Bivariate)	Factors that predicted likelihood of remaining in position (Multivariate, without salary)	Factors that predicted likelihood of remaining in position (Multivariate, with salary)
Received training on community services for families	1.84*		
Home visitor characteristics			
Race and ethnicity	1.16	1.31^	1.13
3+ years of experience in home visiting	1.86**	2.38***	2.19**
Bachelors degree or higher	0.74	0.60^	0.44*
Depressive symptoms	0.50***	0.84	0.89
Experienced discrimination in the workplace	0.60	0.47^	0.39^
Caseload size	0.97	1.12	1.28
Caseload has families experiencing unemployment	0.77	0.87	0.69
Caseload has families experiencing prenatal or postpartum depression and/or mental illness	1.03		
Caseload has families involved in the child welfare system	0.97		
Satisfied with the amount of on-the-job stress	2.55***	2.10**	2.70**
Full-time staff salary	1.00^		1.00*

Note: ^ = $p \leq 0.1$ * = $p \leq 0.05$ ** = $p \leq 0.01$ *** = $p \leq 0.001$